

**Toronto
Port
Authority**



**Administration
Portuaire
de Toronto**

Geoffrey A. Wilson
President & Chief Executive Officer
Président-directeur général

60 Harbour Street, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5J 1B7

Tel/Tél: 416.863.2037 • Fax/Télécopieur: 416.863.0495 • email: gwilson@torontoport.com

Mr. Brian Iler
Chair
Community AIR
7th Floor, 150 John Street
Toronto, ON M5V 3E3

April 22, 2013

Dear Mr. Iler:

I am responding to your letter dated April 17, 2013. I am particularly concerned with some of its incorrect conclusions and factual inaccuracies. I will endeavor to correct them for you and your membership here.

For further information we would recommend you visit the Toronto Port Authority's web site, which contains a large amount of information on such matters over the course of many years.

On April 10, 2013 Porter Airlines made an announcement of their intentions to expand their operations. I will forward your letter to Porter for their information as you suggest. As an independent operation, it is up to Porter to pursue its own business plan for the benefit of its customers, shareholders and employees. The TPA takes no position on Porter's business aspirations. The TPA will not consider any change of use to the airport until a determination is first made by the elected representatives on Toronto City Council regarding Porter's proposed changes to the 1983 Tripartite Agreement.

Should the Toronto City Council consent to Porter's Proposal, the TPA will need to better understand the noise profile and other potential issues relating to Porter's proposed use of CS 100 Bombardier aircraft before we can properly consider Porter's plans or comment about them.

Meanwhile, we are concerned with inaccurate and misleading statements regarding the Q400 aircraft and their compliance within the Tripartite Agreement. You refer to a February 2009 slide presentation that was provided publicly and created by Jacobs Consultancy – an internationally accredited and recognized aviation expert. While you captured some of the summary data presented on slide 26, you failed to include the next three slides of explanatory data which were also presented by Jacobs, and importantly exclude the conclusion slide 30, titled: "Tripartite Agreement Compliance" and which content states clearly:

The DASH 8 – Q400-402 aircraft used by Porter Airlines

- *Has noise levels below the criteria for an ‘ aircraft generating excessive noise’*
- *Is compliant with the Tripartite Agreement*

Community Air members and interested public can access this Jacobs presentation on the the Toronto Port Authority website at <http://www.torontoport.com/Airport/Community-Relations/Public-Information-Materials.aspx>.

You state in your April 17, 2013 letter, “*the TPA has claimed it can average the breaches out, borrowing from one parameter to address another*”. This is without basis. By way of factual explanation for your membership, the term “*aircraft generating excessive noise*” is defined in the next section 14 (2) which states that these aircraft shall be determined by reference to the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) listing. The section goes on to categorize aircraft into four groups:

1. Propeller driven aeroplanes not exceeding 5,700 kg maximum takeoff weight (MTOW);
2. Propeller driven aeroplanes exceeding 5,700 kg MTOW other than short takeoff and landing (STOL) aircraft;
3. Propeller driven aeroplanes exceeding 5,700 kg MTOW and classified as STOL aircraft; and,
4. Propeller driven aeroplanes not included in ICAO listing.

The Dash 8 Q400 aircraft which Porter Airlines utilizes is defined by Category 2 and “excessive noise” is defined for this category under three (3) flight conditions as a noise level in excess of:

84.0 Effective Perceived Noise in Decibels (EPNdB) on takeoff (flyover)

83.5 EPNdB on sideline at takeoff (lateral to flight path)

92.0 EPNdB on approach

All calculated in accordance with the procedures set out in ICAO Annex 16, Chapter 5 and Appendix 2.

The ICAO has compiled a noise database for various aircraft types. For the Q400, there are 30 different versions listed. In general, these are divided into three groupings:

Dash 8 – Q400

Dash 8 – Q401

Dash 8 – Q402

The version of the Q400 that Porter operates is the Dash 8 – Q402 with a MTOW of 28,998 kg, a maximum landing weight (MLW) of 28,009 kg and a modification which limits the engine to 850 RPM on approach (Modification No. 39).

The certification noise levels for this version are:

78.0 EPNdB on takeoff (flyover)

84.0 EPNdB on sideline at takeoff (lateral to flight path)

93.1 EPNdB on approach

The Tripartite Agreement states that the noise levels are to be calculated in accordance with ICAO, Annex 16, Chapter 5 and Appendix 2.

In Annex 16, Chapter 5, under 5.5 Trade-Offs, it states:

“If the maximum noise levels are exceeded at one or two measurement points;

- a) the sum of excesses shall not be greater than 3 EPNdB;
- b) any excess at any single point shall not be greater than 2 EPNdB; and
- c) any excesses shall be offset by corresponding reductions at the other point or points.”

In the case of the Dash 8 – Q402 with Modification No. 39, (850 RPM Approach):

	Q402	Tripartite	Difference		
Flyover	78.0	84.0	-6.0	Reduction	Okay.
Lateral	84.0	83.5	0.5	Excess	Okay. Does not exceed 2.0
Approach	93.1	92.0	1.1	Excess	Okay. Does not exceed 2.0
		Total Excess Values	1.6		Okay. Does not exceed 3.0
		Total Reduction Values	-6.0		Okay. Reduction > than Total Excess
		Net Values	-4.4		Meets Tripartite Agreement

As shown, the Dash 8 Q400 aircraft which is utilized by carriers Porter Airlines and Air Canada is compliant with the Tripartite Agreement and has noise levels below the criteria for an “**aircraft generating excessive noise**”.

I trust this is helpful to your membership and clarifies the issue for you.

Sincerely,



Geoffrey A. Wilson

President & Chief Executive Officer